**00084531: Decentralization and Local Governance Project**

**Annual Progress Report**

**January – December 2015**

Photo credits and caption

**Project Snapshot**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Date: | | | January- December 2015 | | | |
| Award ID: | | | 00070684 | | | |
| Project ID: | | | 00084531 | | | |
| Project Title: | | | Decentralization and Local Governance Project | | | |
| Project Start Date: | | | March 2013 | | | |
| Project End Date: | | | December 2017 | | | |
| Implementing Partner: | | | UNDP | | | |
| Responsible Parties: | | | Ministry of Inter-Provincial Coordination, Planning and Development Department Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Local Government Departments Balochistan and KP, Centre for Civic Education, Higher Education Commission of Punjab, Chief Minister’s Policy Reform Unit, Council of Pakistan Newspaper Editors, Centre for Peace and Development Initiatives, National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research and RSM Pakistan | | | |
| Project Budget (all years): | | | $ 15,700,835/- | | | |
| Core Resources:  Non-Core Resources:  Government contribution:  Donor 1  Donor 2 | | | $ 15,000,000/- | | | |
| **Project Brief Description and Outputs:** Decentralization & Local Governance (D&LG) is a multi-year, multi-tier, multi sector and multi-stakeholder project launched by UNDP Pakistan to strengthen participatory federalism and decentralization against the backdrop of 18th Constitutional Amendment (2010). The Project views the 18th Amendment through a governance, development and public policy lens and identifies strategic areas of intervention to transition management of democratic devolution at federal, provincial and local levels. The core objective of the project is to assist institutional mechanisms to strengthen effective service delivery for peace and development and ultimately contribute to the Sustainable Development Goals.  D&LG Project has four outputs:   * Constitutional Federal organs are successfully established to conduct devolution related duties and are supported on policy, regulatory and supervisory roles. * Provincial Governments are technically supported to develop legislative, institutional and policy frameworks on devolved subjects. * Local Governments incorporate and use methodologies of participatory development planning, implementation and monitoring. * Decentralization and local governance is integrated in advocacy and civil society agenda. | | | | | | |
| Overall Project Quality Rating (mark on the scale of 1 to 5 as per the following criteria): | | | | | | |
| Exemplary (5)  \*\*\*\*\* | High (4)  \*\*\*\* | | | Satisfactory (3)  \*\*\* | Poor (2)  \*\* | Inadequate (1)  \* |
| All outputs are rated High or Exemplary | All outputs are rated Satisfactory or higher, and at least two criteria are rated High or Exemplary | | | One output may be rated Poor, and all other criteria are rated Satisfactory or higher | Two outputs are rated Poor, and all other criteria are rated Satisfactory or higher | One output is rated Inadequate, or more than two criteria are rated Poor |
| Budget 2015 | | 986,122 | | | | |
| Expenditure 2015 | | 986,122 | | | | |
| Delivery % | | 100% | | | | |

**Contents**

Table of Contents

[1. Introduction 4](#_Toc379272472)

[2. Situation Analysis](#_Toc379272473) 5

[3. Project Performance and results](#_Toc379272474) 6

[3.1 Contribution towards Country Programme Outcome](#_Toc379272475) 7

[3.2 Progress towards Project Results/Outputs](#_Toc379272476) 9

[4. Lessons Learnt](#_Toc379272477) 16

[5. The way forward/ key Priorities for 2016 16](#_Toc379272478)

[Annex: AWP based Reporting Matrix 18](#_Toc379272479)

1. **Introduction**

The 18th Constitutional Amendment has not only revived but also re-oriented radically the democratic and federalist fundamentals of the State of Pakistan. The Amendment is believed to have brought about a set of comprehensive structural changes to guide and redefine the nature of governance in Pakistan. By restoring balance between the Federation and Provinces, the 18th Amendment has emerged as a landmark piece of legislation that could lead to a paradigm shift in Pakistan‘s mode of governance and constitutional architecture.

UNDP Pakistan in order to support the Government of Pakistan in implementation of the 18th amendment developed in close consultation with the Federal Government, development partners and Provincial Governments the project Decentralization and Local Governance. The project is guided by agreed outcomes and targets that contribute to the Common Country Program Action Plan (CCPAP).

The Project views the 18th Amendment through a governance, development and public policy lens and identifies strategic areas of intervention to transition management of democratic devolution at federal, provincial and local levels. The core objective of the project is to assist institutional mechanisms to strengthen effective service delivery for peace and development and ultimately contribute to the Sustainable Development Goals.

In 2015, with the local government elections in the provinces the project redesigned its priority focus towards assisting the provinces in smooth transition towards effective local governments.

1. **SITUATION ANALYSIS**

The 18th Amendment to the Constitution of Pakistan (2010) has introduced important steps towards the devolution of authority to local government. The constitution defines four parameters – political, administrative, financial and electoral – for devolving authority, power and resources to elected local governments.

The provincial governments under Article 140 (A) are obligated to hold local government elections in their respective provinces. The year 2015 saw provincial governments of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Sindh and Punjab hold the local government elections, which was a landmark achievement for Pakistan. However, the whole local governance structure in Pakistan is still in its infancy and it remains to be seen how it shapes up in the year 2016.

In 2016, the local government system will be shaped by budget approvals and local government structures slowly defining and finding their routines and trainings. Moreover, it remains to be seen how operational the provincial governments want the local governments to be. For a strong federation to work, the provincial assemblies must recognize that autonomous local governments are essential for improved governance and service delivery, but they also need to create laws that better clarify the division of power and functions between the provincial and local governments.

Local Governments Acts in provinces envisage devolution of a long list of very important functions including the authority to operate, manage and control devolved offices coupled with mandate and obligation of coordination, human resource management, planning, development, finance and budgeting for the services devolved to local governments. Efficient discharge of these functions would require the availability, as well as, proper positioning of professionally qualified persons which in turn would need major capacities and skills development at the provincial and district level in 2016.

If strong institutional mechanisms at the local level are not established it will allow elite to capture power and resources; which could lead to manipulation of the process of prioritization and resource allocation which will affect the ownership, efficiency and quality of service delivery at the local level.

In order to support the local government system, UNDP Pakistan will focus on strengthening local governance institutions for improved service delivery to achieve the post-2015 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

1. **Project Performance and results** 
   1. **Contribution towards Country Programme Outcome[[1]](#footnote-1)**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CPAP Outcome:  Strengthened Decentralized Governance | | | |
| Indicator(s): Number of gender-sensitive legislative reforms; capacity-building initiatives that facilitate implementation of the 18th Amendment; | Baseline: 18th Constitutional Amendment passed in 2010 and provinces to pass necessary legislation and reorganization to complete the process | Target(s): 0 Gender-sensitive legislative reforms; 3 Capacity building initiatives | Achievement(s):  1. Balochistan Development Forum provided a public forum to Government of Balochistan to share its  vision and framework on paradigm shift from security to development (output 2)  2. Institutional strengthening of the Planning and Development Department KP (output 2)  3. Supported the establishment of Higher Education Commission Punjab (output 2), set up interprovincial forum on local governance, established transition cells in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan to assist local government departments, skill enhancement trainings for 73 Tehsil Naib Nazimeen and 73 Tehsil Nazimeen from all over Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 1,909 elected councilors from districts Battagram and Karak (output 3) |
| Description of output level high/outcome level results achieved in 2015:  The project outputs 2 and 3 contributed towards CCPAPA outcome of strengthened decentralized governance. Three capacity building initiatives were undertaken which include a) building the capacity of provincial government of Balochistan through creating a policy, planning and implementation interface b) provided technical experts to the Planning and Development Department KP in order to support its restructuring in light of the 18th amendment c) supporting the provincial governments to operationalize 18th amendment by providing assistance to the Punjab Higher Education Commission and supporting the provinces in effective devolution management following the local government elections. Brief description of these initiatives is as follows:  **Development Agenda of Balochistan**  To enhance the capacity of provincial governments, UNDP supported the Government of Balochistan to share their vision and framework on paradigm shift from security to development. Through the support from UNDP the Balochistan Development Forum was held to create a policy, planning and implementation interface for equitable and effective service delivery. The idea of the forum was to facilitate development partners in achieving aid-effectiveness and harmonization in Balochsitan. The forum provided an opportunity to the Balochistan Government to present their sectoral strategies to the key stakeholders including the development partners. (E1) (Output 2)  **Institutional Strengthening of P&DD KP**  On request from the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Planning and Development Department, UNDP provided institutional development expert in order to review existing capacity of the department and identify gaps following the 18th amendment. The experts were responsible to provide recommendations for upscaling the Planning and Development Department to handle more strategic and growth oriented policies. Following a detailed review of the existing policies and administrative structure of the department the experts recommended establishment of a technical support unit with the responsibility to improve governance by improving the planning, monitoring and implementation capacity of the department. The technical support unit will have three sections, planning and monitoring section, economic growth section and project appraisal unit. (E2) (Output 2)  **Operationalizing 18th Amendment**  After the 18th amendment of the constitution of Pakistan, education has been shifted to the legislative and executive jurisdiction of the provinces. In light of this UNDP supported the establishment of Punjab Higher Education Commission (PHEC) and provided technical assistance to draft their road map on higher education and also assist them in setting up their administrative structure.(E3) (Output 2)  **Establishment of Interprovincial Mechanism on Local Governance**  UNDP organized an interprovincial forum on improving local governance in order to bring relevant officials of government departments on one platform where they can deliberate and share knowledge about governance of devolved subjects. The forum was successfully able to establish an interprovincial working group on local governance which would become part of the system where provinces would regularly come together and discuss about common challenges and issues. (E4) (Output 3)  **Effective Local Governance Devolution Management**  UNDP established technical support cells in both KP and Balochistan provinces to assist the department in administrative, financial and institutional responsibilities to ensure smooth transfer of responsibilities to the elected representatives (E5) (Output 3)  **Operationalizing Local Governments**  UNDP in collaboration with the local government department held training workshops for 73 Tehsil Naib Nazimeen and 73 Tehsil Nazimeen from all over Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. In addition, 1,909 elected councilors from districts Battagram and Karak were also trained on the roles and responsibilities assigned to them under the Local Government Act 2013 [E51]. These interventions resulted in building necessary skills at the provincial level to promote democratic governance at the local level. (E6) (Output 3) | | | |
| Means of Verification:  E1-Balochistan Development Forum Report E2-Institutional Strengthening of Planning and Development Department Report E3-Notification for establishment of Punjab Higher Education Commission E4-Interprovincial Meetings Report E5-Local Government Department Consultants Report E6- Training Reports | | | |

* 1. **Progress towards Project Results/Outputs[[2]](#footnote-2)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Project Output I:**  Constitutional Federal organs are successfully established to conduct devolution related duties and are supported on policy, regulatory and supervisory roles. | | | | | | | |
| Indicator(s):  1.1 Independent Secretariat of CCI is established & functional  1.2 Improved capacity of federal & provincial IPC departments in managing post 18th amendment transition management  1.3 Improved coordination & awareness between federal and provincial government on 18th amendment transition management | | Baseline:  1.1 No independent secretariat of CCI is established and functional  1.2 Federal & provincial Governments lack capacity to implement 18th amendment  1.3 Lack of coordination between federal & provinces on subjects listed on FLII | | Target(s):  1.1 Independent secretariat of CCI is established & functional  1.2 Federal & provincial IPC departments are managing post 18th amendment transition  1.3 Coordination mechanism set up and functional between federal and provincial governments on subjects listed in FL II | | Achievement(s):  1.1 Devolution Management Information System (DMIS) and website developed for CCI Secretariat to document and streamline the devolution process  1.2 Not achieved  1.3 Not achieved | |
| Description of output level results achieved in 2015:  **Target 1.1**  **Strengthening the Secretariat of the Council of Common Interest:**  The Ministry of Inter-Provincial Coordination is currently serving as the interim Secretariat of the Council of Common Interest (CCI). UNDP in order to support the CCI Secretariat and to ensure better documentation of the devolution process conducted a needs assessment to develop a Devolution Management Information System (DMIS). Following the assessment an IT based firm was hired to develop a devolution management system and website for the CCI secretariat. The system has been installed which helps CCI secretariat keep track of resources, ensures better quality of information, and improves coordination and communication between provinces to ensure decisions are taken in an efficient and timely manner. (E7) | | | | | | | |
| Overall Output Status (mark the output on the scale of 1 to 5 as per the following criteria): | | | | | | | |
| Exemplary (5)  \*\*\*\*\* | High (4)  \*\*\*\* | | Satisfactory (3)  \*\*\* | | Poor (2)  \*\* | | Inadequate (1)  \* |
| The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality, and there is evidence that outputs are contributing to targeted outcomes | The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to achieve targeted outputs with expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to partially achieve targeted outputs, with less than expected levels of quality | | Project outputs will likely not be achieved and/or are not likely to be effective in supporting the achievement of targeted outcomes |
| Means of Verification   * DMIS Final Report * [www.cci.gov.pk](http://www.cci.gov.pk) | | | | | | | |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Project Output II:** Provincial Governments are technically supported to develop legislative, institutional and policy frameworks on devolved subjects. | | | | | | | |
| Indicator(s):  2.1 Enhanced capacity of government of Balochistan & KP on decentralized governance.  2.2 Established & operational autonomous institutions on devolved subjects | | Baseline:  2.1 Provincial governments are still grappling with challenges of devolution management, tracking and monitoring of policy decisions remains weak at all tiers of government, no progress report published on the current status of the implementation of 18th amendment.  2.2 No autonomous institutions on devolved subjects | | Target(s)  2.1 Improved capacity of governments of Balochsitan & KP to take on governance responsibilities following the devolution process.  2.2 1 autonomous institution functional on devolved subjects | | Achievement(s):  2.1 Balochistan Development Forum provided a public forum to Government of Balochistan to share its  vision and framework on paradigm shift from security to development, Institutional strengthening of the Planning and Development Department KP, Conduct a scoping study on strengthening human rights institutions at the provincial level KP  2.2 Supported the establishment of Higher Education Commission Punjab | |
| Description of output level results achieved in 2015:  **Target 2.1**  **Development Agenda of Balochistan**  To enhance the capacity of provincial governments, UNDP supported the Government of Balochistan to share their vision and framework on paradigm shift from security to development. Through the support from UNDP the Balochistan Development Forum was held to create a policy, planning and implementation interface for equitable and effective service delivery. The idea of the forum was to facilitate development partners in achieving aid-effectiveness and harmonization in Balochsitan. The forum provided an opportunity to the Balochistan Government to present their sectoral strategies to the key stakeholders including the development partners. (E1)  **Institutional Strengthening of P&DD KP**  On request from the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Planning and Development Department, UNDP provided institutional development expert in order to review existing capacity of the department and identify gaps following the 18th amendment. The experts were responsible to provide recommendations for upscaling the Planning and Development Department to handle more strategic and growth oriented policies. Following a detailed review of the existing policies and administrative structure of the department the experts recommended establishment of a technical support unit with the responsibility to improve governance by improving the planning, monitoring and implementation capacity of the department. The technical support unit will have three sections, planning and monitoring section, economic growth section and project appraisal unit. (E2)  **Human Rights Upfront** The project commissioned a study to elicit the role of provincial departments, human rights bodies and civil society organizations on the subject of promotion, monitoring and reporting of human rights obligations at all tiers of government within the province. The recommendations of the study include a) government and line department lack human and material resources b) all concerned officers lacked knowledge about human rights treaties, protocols, state reports and functioning of the various treaty committees c) there is no coordination and networking mechanism between different stakeholders. (E8)  **Target 2.2**  **Operationalizing 18th Amendment**  After the 18th amendment of the constitution of Pakistan, education has been shifted to the legislative and executive jurisdiction of the provinces. In light of this UNDP supported the establishment of Punjab Higher Education Commission (PHEC) and provided technical assistance to draft their road map on higher education and also assist them in setting up their administrative structure. (E3) | | | | | | | |
| Overall Output Status (mark the output on the scale of 1 to 5 as per the following criteria): | | | | | | | |
| Exemplary (5)  \*\*\*\*\* | High (4)  \*\*\*\* | | Satisfactory (3)  \*\*\* | | Poor (2)  \*\* | | Inadequate (1)  \* |
| The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality, and there is evidence that outputs are contributing to targeted outcomes | The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to achieve targeted outputs with expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to partially achieve targeted outputs, with less than expected levels of quality | | Project outputs will likely not be achieved and/or are not likely to be effective in supporting the achievement of targeted outcomes |
| Means of Verification:  E1-Balochistan Development Forum Report E2-Institutional Strengthening of Planning and Development Department Report E3-Notification for establishment of Punjab Higher Education Commission  E8- The state of Rights Protection and Promotion Institutions in KP after the 18th Amendment | | | | | | | |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Project Output III:**  Local Governments incorporate and use methodologies of participatory development planning, implementation and monitoring. | | | | | | | |
| Indicator(s):  3.1: Participatory development planning, implementation and monitoring incorporated in LGs  3.2: Enhanced capacity of LG Department in managing their roles and responsibilities  3.3: Improved inter-provincial coordination | | Baseline:  3.1 No LGs functional in provinces  3.2 25 Master trainers trained, no operational plans  3.3 No inter-provincial forum exists | | Target(s):  3.1 LG functional in two provinces  3.2 Enhanced capacity of LG elected members & officials in managing their roles & responsibilities  3.3 Forum for inter-provincial coordination exist and is functional | | Achievement(s):  3.1 Skill enhancement trainings for 73 Tehsil Naib Nazimeen and 73 Tehsil Nazimeen from all over Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. 1,909 elected councilors from districts Battagram and Karak.  3.2. Established transition cells in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan to assist local government departments  3.2 Developed the local governance strategy framework for all 4 provinces  3.3 Set up interprovincial forum on local governance, public health governance, higher education governance and extractives sector governance | |
| Description of output level results achieved in 2015:  **Target 3.1**  **Operationalizing Local Governments**  UNDP in collaboration with the local government department held training workshops for 73 Tehsil Naib Nazimeen and 73 Tehsil Nazimeen from all over Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. In addition, 1,909 elected councilors from districts Battagram and Karak were also trained on the roles and responsibilities assigned to them under the Local Government Act 2013. These interventions resulted in building necessary skills at the provincial level to promote democratic governance at the provincial and local level. In order to follow up the effectiveness of trainings detailed reports will be submitted to the project by implementing partner which evaluate in detail the effectiveness of the trainings. (E6)[[3]](#footnote-3)  **Target 3.2**  **Effective Local Governance Devolution Management**  UNDP established technical support cells by assisting both KP and Balochistan through providing them with sector experts to assist the departments in administrative, financial and institutional responsibilities to ensure smooth transfer of responsibilities to the elected representatives. To establish a robust monitoring mechanism for reporting the project established monthly reporting formats which the consultants were responsible to submit at the end of every month. (E5)  In addition to assist the local government departments in order to effectively and efficiently operationalize the local governments. UNDP commissioned a research study to develop a detailed program for 4 years for providing technical assistance to the local government departments in all 4 provinces. The strategy framework provides detailed description of support required by the local government departments in areas of policy, capacity, institutional mechanism and fiscal decentralization; this would ensure better utilization of resources of development partners and support the establishment of robust and effective local governments. (E9)[[4]](#footnote-4)  **Target 3.3**  **Establishment of Interprovincial Mechanism on Local Governance**  UNDP in collaboration with Konard Adeneaur Stiftung organized four interprovincial meetings in areas of local governance, higher education governance, public health governance and extractives sector governance. The two-day meetings included participants from relevant line departments from all four provinces across Pakistan. The meeting deliberated on strengthening legislative, institutional and operational dimensions of improving governance of devolved subjects (local governance, health, higher education and extractives). All the meetings concluded with the participants agreeing to establish a semi-formal working group on interprovincial coordination. The participants felt that it was of paramount importance that after the 18th amendment the provinces have a joint platform to meet and share experiences and understanding of the common issues. During the upcoming year and as a follow up to these meetings the project will focus on institutionalizing these forums in Government line departments. E4[[5]](#footnote-5) | | | | | | | |
| Overall Output Status (mark the output on the scale of 1 to 5 as per the following criteria): | | | | | | | |
| Exemplary (5)  \*\*\*\*\* | High (4)  \*\*\*\* | | Satisfactory (3)  \*\*\* | | Poor (2)  \*\* | | Inadequate (1)  \* |
| The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality, and there is evidence that outputs are contributing to targeted outcomes | The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to achieve targeted outputs with expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to partially achieve targeted outputs, with less than expected levels of quality | | Project outputs will likely not be achieved and/or are not likely to be effective in supporting the achievement of targeted outcomes |
| Means of Verification:   * E4-Interprovincial Meetings Report * E5- Local Government Department Consultants Report * E9- Local Government Strategy Framework * E6-Trainings Report | | | | | | | |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Project Output IV:  Decentralization and local governance is integrated in advocacy and civil society agenda | | | | | | | |
| Indicator(s):  4.1: Enhanced capacity of media practitioners on decentralized governance reporting  4.2: Improved knowledge and awareness on federalism & decentralization  4.3: Extent to which RTI & article 172(3) is effectively operationalized | | Baseline:  4.1 200 media practitioners trained  4.2 Lack of awareness amongst citizens & CSOs on federalism & decentralization  4.3 Both RTI and article 172(3) have not been operationalized at federal and provincial levels | | Target(s):  4.1 400 media practitioners trained on reporting on decentralized governance  4.2 Constitutional literacy, policy research and advocacy on federalism & decentralization in Pakistan is improved  4.3 1 citizens information & accountability forum set up and operationalized and 1 scoping study on governance in extractives sector | | Achievement(s):  4.1 400 Media practitioners trained on federalism and decentralization  4.2 Policy research and advocacy lectures, working papers through Pakistan study group on federalism  4.3 Citizens information and accountability forum set up in district Multan  4.3. Conducted a study on Mapping and Analysing the Constitutional, Legal, Institutional and Financial Aspects of Extractive Industry Governance in Pakistan | |
| Description of output level results achieved in 2015:  **Target 4.1**  **Decentralized Development Governance Training:**  The project developed a three day course and conducted trainings for working journalists from print and electronic media. The objective of the trainings was to develop and deepen the understanding of reporting and editorial staff of newspapers and electronic media on issues related to decentralized development governance in Pakistan. Particularly, the project was expected to improve the frequency and quality of reporting, analysis and editorial appreciation of issues related to the transition management and implementation of the 18th Constitutional Amendment at federal and provincial levels. 5 training modules were developed to train 400 media practitioners in Karachi, Lahore, Peshawar and Quetta. (E10) After the completion of the trainings a detailed report including a feedback from every the participant was conducted to evaluate the effectiveness of the trainings.  **Target 4.2**  **Policy Research and Advocacy**  The Pakistan Study Group on Federalism (PSGF) was established to mobilize and network a community of practise on participatory federalism and decentralization in the country. The PSGF contributes to a body of academic, policy, technical and hands-on knowledge aimed to facilitate and inform the process of transition management of the 18th Constitutional Amendment. The study group during the year organized 6 lectures from renowned scholars, held 3 interactive talk shows between political party representatives and academia and developed 6 working papers on federal legislative II subjects. (E11) The activities helped the project generate critical mass and advocacy on operationalizing the 18th amendment. During the implementation of these activities the project was able to advocate for establishment of a committee in Senate of Pakistan to monitor the implementation of 18th amendment.  **Target 4.3**  **Mapping and Analysing the Constitutional, Legal, Institutional and Financial Aspects of Extractive Industry Governance in Pakistan**  In order to effectively implement Article 172(3) it was considered important to study the legal and constitutional implications of extractives sector governance in Pakistan. In this regard, the project commissioned a study to map and analyze the constitutional, legal, institutional and financial aspects of the extractive industries governance in Pakistan, with a particular focus on the implications of the Article 172(3) of the Constitution of Pakistan. The study will be completed in early part of 2016. (E12)  **Citizen Information and Accountability Forum (CIAF), Multan (Punjab)**  A sector specific forum was constituted to increase awareness and operationalize Right to Information Law in district Multan, Punjab. After established of the forum the 30 members’ are now employing Right to Information legislation as a tool to hold public bodies accountable in their district. (E13) | | | | | | | |
| Overall Output Status (mark the output on the scale of 1 to 5 as per the following criteria): | | | | | | | |
| Exemplary (5)  \*\*\*\*\* | High (4)  \*\*\*\* | | Satisfactory (3)  \*\*\* | | Poor (2)  \*\* | | Inadequate (1)  \* |
| The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality, and there is evidence that outputs are contributing to targeted outcomes | The project is expected to over-achieve targeted outputs and/or expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to achieve targeted outputs with expected levels of quality | | The project is expected to partially achieve targeted outputs, with less than expected levels of quality | | Project outputs will likely not be achieved and/or are not likely to be effective in supporting the achievement of targeted outcomes |
| Means of Verification:   * E10-Media Trainings Report * E11- Lectures and Working Papers * E12- Extractives Study Report * E-13- CIAF Final Report | | | | | | | |

1. **Lessons Learnt**

The implementation of the project yielded certain key lessons these include:

* Massive constitutional reforms such as the 18th Constitutional Amendment require substantial time, resources, commitment and capacity to translate a federal framework into an effective and sustainable functional reality for the provinces. (CCPAP 4.4 , Project output 1)
* To increase coordination with line department there is a need to identify a focal persons from the department for dealing with matters related to UNDP projects (CCPAPA 4.4, Project output 2)
* Adequate time for delays needs to be set aside while dealing with federal ministries (CCPAPA 4.4, Project output 1)
* Informal stakeholder forums with participation of different political parties should be undertaken to deepen understanding and implications of 18th amendment, and highlight challenges in implementation. (CCPAPA 4.4, Project output 1)
* Project needs strengthen provincial information exchanges, coordination and communication in key government counterpart departments to improve progress towards the devolution process. (CCPAPA 4.4, Project output 2)
* There is a need to sensitize donors as well as government departments about the importance of training the elected members on their roles and responsibilities after the local government elections in the provinces. (CCPAPA 4.4, Project output 3)

1. **The way forward/ key Priorities FOR 2015**

In 2016, all interventions under the project will work with and build capacities of existing and new institutional structures. The project will employ a consultative process in designing the project activities which will ensure that all interventions reflect the priorities of the relevant stakeholders. The priorities for 2016 include the following:

1. **Institutional strengthening of village councils/neighborhood councils in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa through local governance assistance.**

The project will work with elected representative of the village/neighborhood councils to build and develop their capacities at the local level for improving quality, outreach and standard of social and municipal services. (CCPAPA 4.4, Project output 3)

1. **Technical assistance and capacity development for all provinces through their respective Local Governance Reform Mechanisms (Reform Cells)**

Continue assisting transition cells in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan and establish cells in Punjab and Sindh to support departments in effective devolution and transition management. (CCPAPA 4.4, Project output 3)

1. **Support Departments & Institutions in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa for promotion & protection of Human Rights upfront mechanisms.**

The objective of the project is to assist Khyber Pakhtunkhwa to establish its clear role in formulizing a Human Rights Policy. The project seeks to strengthen the capacity of the Human Rights Commission Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Law and Human Rights Department, Social Welfare and Women Development Department and the Standing Committee on Human Rights at the Provincial Assembly for better service delivery, monitoring, reporting and implementation following the devolution chain on a host of human rights related tasks stemming from the 18th constitutional amendment. (CCPAPA 4.4, Project output 2)

1. **Institutionalize Inter-Provincial Mechanisms for coordinating governance priorities on devolved issues**

The project will continue to facilitate interprovincial mechanisms where officials of departments would come together to discuss and deliberate about common challenges and issues of governance of devolved subjects. (CCPAPA 4.4, Project output 1)

1. **Institutional Development of Planning and Development Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa**

Following a detailed review of the existing policies and administrative structure of the department. D&LG project in 2016 will support the establishment of a technical support unit with the responsibility to improve governance by improving the planning, monitoring and implementation capacity of the department.

(CCPAPA 4.4, Project output 2)

**Annex: AWP based Reporting Matrix**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| EXPECTED OUTPUTS  *And baseline, associated indicators and annual targets* | PLANNED ACTIVITIES (as per AWP) | Activity Status  *Completed, Ongoing, Delayed, Cancelled* | AWP Budget ($) | Expenditure ($) | % Delivery |
| Output1: Constitutional Federal organs are successfully established to conduct devolution related duties and are supported on policy, regulatory and supervisory roles.  Indicators: 1.1 Independent Secretariat of CCI is established & functional  Baseline: No independent secretariat of CCI is established and functional  Targets: Independent secretariat of CCI is established & functional  Indicator: 1.2 Improved capacity of federal & provincial IPC departments in managing post 18th amendment transition management  Baseline: Federal & provincial Governments lack capacity to implement 18th amendment  Target: Federal & provincial IPC departments are managing post 18th amendment transition  Indicator : 1.3 Improved coordination & awareness between federal and provincial government on 18th amendment transition management  Baseline: Lack of coordination between federal & provinces on subjects listed on FLII  Target: Coordination mechanism set up and functional between federal and provincial governments on subjects listed in FL II | Devolution Management Information System for CCI developed and operationalized for documenting decisions and tracking implementation | Completed | 13,600 | 13,600 | 100% |
| Output 2: Provincial Governments are technically supported to develop legislative, institutional and policy frameworks on devolved subjects.  Indicators: 2.1 Enhanced capacity of government of  Balochistan & KP on decentralized governance  Baseline: provincial governments are still grappling with challenges of devolution management, tracking and monitoring of policy decisions remains weak at all tiers of government, no progress report published on the current status of the implementation of 18th amendment  Targets: improved capacity of governments of Balochsitan & KP to take on governance responsibilities following the devolution process  Indicators: 2.2 Established & operational autonomous institutions on devolved subjects  Baseline: No autonomous institutions on devolved subjects  Target: 1 autonomous institution functional on devolved subjects | Organize & follow up of BDF | Completed | 54,000 | 53,328 | 98.7% |
| Provincial Planning and Development Department in KP is strengthened to manage, track and monitor projects to achieve development effectiveness. | Completed | 65,000 | 39,270 | 60.4% |
| Conduct a scoping study on strengthening human rights institutions at the provincial level KP | Completed | 7,850 | 3,335 | 42.5% |
| Support for establishment of HEC Punjab | Completed | 20,000 | 19,942 | 99.7% |
| Output 3: Local Governments incorporate and use methodologies of participatory development planning, implementation and monitoring.  Indicators 3.1: Participatory development planning, implementation and monitoring incorporated in LGs  Baseline: No LGs functional in provinces  Targets: LG functional in two provinces  Indicators 3.2: Enhanced capacity of LG Department in managing their roles and responsibilities  Baseline: 25 Master trainers trained, no operational plans  Target: Enhanced capacity of LG elected members & officials in managing their roles & responsibilities  Indicators 3.3: Improved inter-provincial coordination  Baseline: No inter-provincial forum exists  Target: Forum for inter-provincial coordination exist and is functional | Establish technical support cells in KP & Balochistan LG departments to provide support in developing a devolution planning and strategy framework | Completed | 264,000 | 243,913 | 92.3% |
| Develop operational & training plans | Completed | 60,000 | 60,000 | 100% |
| Train LG Members | Completed | 45,000 | 45,000 | 100% |
| Establish 4 interprovincial forums on devolved subjects | Completed | 40,000 | 20,373 | 50.9% |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Output 4: Decentralization and local governance is integrated in advocacy and civil society agenda.  Indicator 4.1: Enhanced capacity of media practitioners on decentralized governance reporting  Baseline: 200 media practitioners trained  Target: 400 media practitioners trained on reporting on decentralized governance  Indicator 4.2: Improved knowledge and awareness on federalism & decentralization  Baseline: Lack of awareness amongst citizens & CSOs on federalism & decentralization  Target: Constitutional literacy, policy research and advocacy on federalism & decentralization in Pakistan is improved  Indicator 4.3: Extent to which RTI & article 172(3) is effectively operationalized  Baseline: Both RTI and article 172(3) have not been operationalized at federal and provincial levels  Target: 1 citizens information & accountability forum set up and operationalized and 1 scoping study on governance in extractives sector | Conduct trainings of 400 media practitioners on decentralized development governance | Completed | 9,030 | 9,030 | 100% |
| Policy research and advocacy lectures through Pak Study Group | Completed | 24,310 | 23,699 | 97.4% |
| Citizens information and accountability forum at district level in Punjab (Multan) set up | Completed | 20,000 | 20,000 | 100% |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| TOTAL |  |  | 622,790 | 551,490 | 88.5% |

1. Outcomes describe the intended changes in development conditions that result from the interventions of governments and other stakeholders, including international development agencies such as UNDP. They are medium-term development results created through the delivery of outputs and the contributions of various partners and non-partners. Outcomes provide a clear vision of what has changed or will change globally or in a particular region, country or community within a period of time. They normally relate to changes in institutional performance or behavior among individuals or groups. Outcomes cannot normally be achieved by only one agency and are not under the direct control of a project manager. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Outputs are short-term development results produced by project and non-project activities. They must be achieved with the resources provided and within the time-frame specified (usually less than five years). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. IRRF indicator component 3.2.2.A.1.1 [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. IRRF indicator component 3.2.2.A.1.1 [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. IRRF indicator component 3.2.2.A.1.1 [↑](#footnote-ref-5)